



**Australian
Aid** 



**Study on AADCP II Contribution in Tourism Education
and Training Practices in Myanmar and Philippines,
to facilitate Mutual Recognition Arrangements
in Tourism Professionals**

30 April 2018

ASEAN-Australia Development Cooperation Program Phase II (AADCP II)

© AADCP II

ASEAN – Australia Development Cooperation Program – Phase II
Supporting ASEAN in establishing the ASEAN Economic Community

Post address

The ASEAN Secretariat
Jl. Sisingamangaraja 70A
Jakarta 12110 – Indonesia

Phone: +62 21 726 2991
Fax: +62 21 7278 7252
Email: info@aadcp2.org

Website

<http://www.aadcp2.org>

Disclaimer

This report was prepared as part of monitoring and evaluation of the ASEAN-Australia Development Cooperation Program Phase II (AADCP II). It is produced to facilitate a better understanding of AADCP II contribution to tourism education and training practices in ASEAN, within the context of Mutual Recognition Arrangement on Tourism Professionals. The views and recommendations mentioned in this paper do not necessarily represent or are not necessarily endorsed by the AADCP II nor by relevant agencies in ASEAN Member States.

Acronyms & Abbreviations

AADCP II	ASEAN-Australia Development Cooperation Program Phase II
AEC	ASEAN Economic Community
AMS	ASEAN Member States
ASEAN	Association of Southeast Asian Nations
ATPMC	ASEAN Tourism Professional Monitoring Committee
ACGSTP	ASEAN Common Competency Standards for Tourism Professionals
BSHM	Bachelor of Science in Hospitality Management (Philippines)
BSTM	Bachelor of Science in Tourism Management (Philippines)
CATC	Common ASEAN Tourism Curriculum
CBT	Competency Based Training
CHED	Commission on Higher Education (Philippines)
CMO	Commission on Higher Education Memorandum Order (Philippines)
DoT	Department of Tourism (Philippines)
ESDL	Employment and Skills Development Law (Myanmar)
GoM	Government of Myanmar
HEI	Higher Education Institution
IECD	Institut Européen de Coopération et de Développement
ILO	International Labour Organisation
KEQ	Key Evaluation Questions
MRA-TP	Mutual Recognition Arrangement for Tourism Professionals
MOHT	Ministry of Hotel and Tourism
MTHRDA	Myanmar Tourism Human Resource Development Association
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
NOCS	National Occupational Competency Standards
NSSA	National Skills Standards Authority
NTO	National Tourism Organisation
TESDA	Technical Educational Skills and Development Authority (Philippines)
TIBFI	Tourism Industry Board Foundation Incorporated (Philippines)
ToT	Training of Trainers
TPCB	Tourism Professionals Certification Board
TR	Training Regulation

Table of Contents

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY.....	1
1. INTRODUCTION	2
2. MYANMAR	3
2.1. CONTEXT.....	3
2.2. DESCRIPTION OF OUTCOME.....	3
2.3. OVERALL FINDINGS.....	5
3. PHILIPPINES.....	6
3.1. CONTEXT.....	6
3.2. DESCRIPTION OF OUTCOME.....	6
3.3. OVERALL FINDINGS.....	7
4. DATA SOURCE AND LIMITATIONS OF THIS STUDY.....	7

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

ASEAN-Australia Development Cooperation Program Phase II (AADCP II) is a long-term (2008-2019) program (valued up to AUD\$57 million) that supports ASEAN efforts to implement its ASEAN Economic Community (AEC) priorities. It builds on the first AADCP program that was completed in June 2008. Support for the tourism sector started in the first AADCP program and continued through AADCP II. AADCP II aims to support ASEAN's efforts to facilitate movement of skilled tourism labour through the Mutual Recognition Arrangement on Tourism Professionals (MRA-TP). The program supports the ASEAN Tourism Professionals Monitoring Committee (ATPMC) to facilitate the implementation of the MRA-TP.

AADCP II is implemented through a close partnership with ASEAN, with all decisions on strategic direction and operations made jointly. All AADCP II tourism projects are initiated by ATPMC and the ASEAN Secretariat (ASEC). The program's key implementation partner for tourism services is the ICT and Tourism Division of ASEC. The Division works directly with focal points from all ASEAN Member States (AMS) who represent their country on the ATPMC and are the primary stakeholders of tourism projects. The ATPMC identifies activities and may influence implementation and utilisation of program results by AMS. They are the bridging point for implementing regional priorities at the national level.

The purpose of this episode study was to understand if and how AADCP II (and, to a certain extent, the first AADCP program) has contributed to influencing changes in tourism education and training practices in two AMS: Myanmar and Philippines. The study looked at AADCP II's influence and contribution at two levels: (i) ATPMC members¹ and other respective agencies and (ii) the consequent contribution of ATPMC to other agencies. This study includes evidence from interviews with ATPMC members including tourism education and training providers, as well as a desktop review. While the study acknowledges the data limitations, where possible the evidence was triangulated to strengthen the analysis and findings.

Findings from the study indicate that there are **instances of improved awareness and strengthened capacity of ATPMC members** that are promoting changes in tourism education and training practices in the two AMS. For example, in Myanmar, the Ministry of Hotel and Tourism (MoHT) used AADCP products such as the ASEAN Common Competency Standards for Tourism Professionals (ACCSTP) to develop national occupational competency standard; and the Common ASEAN Tourism Curriculum (CATC) to upgrade the current curriculum for bachelor degree in tourism and hospitality management. Meanwhile, the Philippines has used the AADCP II supported standards and curriculum to review and update its existing training regulations; and utilised training and assessment toolboxes to design its cascade-training program. In summary, progress across the key result areas (improved awareness and strengthened capacity) and observations of utilisation of MRA-TP elements developed by **AADCP II (and the first AADCP program) provide moderate evidence indicating that AADCP II has contributed to strengthening ATPMC in its effort to facilitate implementation of MRA-TP in the two countries.**

¹ ASEAN MRA on Tourism Professionals Handbook noted that ATPMC consists of government institutions in charge of tourism sector and national boards for tourism professionals

1. INTRODUCTION

AADCP II is a long-term program (2008-2019) valued at up to AUD\$57 million that supports ASEAN's efforts to implement AEC priorities. It builds on the first AADCP program that was completed in June 2008. Tourism services is one of the nine work streams of AADCP II. It aims to support ATPMC to promote implementation of the MRA-TP which was adopted by the ASEAN Tourism Ministers in 2012. MRA-TP is an initiative designed to ease movement of skilled tourism labour across ASEAN through mutual recognition of skills and qualifications of tourism professionals.

The program supports ATPMC by developing appropriate standards and best practices; and improved awareness and skills and it is expected that it would help ATPMC members among others, to promote MRA-TP and formulate and update necessary mechanisms to enable the implementation of the MRA-TP.

AADCP II is a grant facility which only supports regional projects endorsed by ASEAN sectoral bodies such as ATPMC and referred through ASEC. AADCP II has limited access to ATPMC and works directly with its ASEC partner, ICT and Tourism Division, who engages with ATPMC. Given AADCP II's partnership modality, it has limited ability to influence projects and project outcomes. ATPMC members are the bridging point for implementing regional priorities agreed by ATPMC in their respective countries. Regional priorities are not always a national priority for AMS and may not be adopted into national plans in all cases. Moreover, neither ASEC nor AADCP II has influence over developments and changes at the national level.

AADCP and AADCP II have supported ATPMC in a number of projects² including reviews, regional standards and training materials, and skills development. Through these projects, a number of products were prepared for ATPMC and endorsed by ASEAN Tourism Ministers including the Common ASEAN Tourism Curriculum (CATC), the ASEAN Common Competency Standards for Tourism Professionals (ACCSTP) and a set of 242 toolboxes for tourism training and assessment based on the ACCSTP. A number of ASEAN Master Trainers and Master Assessors had been trained in the use of these toolboxes, and provided the skills to replicate the Training of Trainers (ToT) in their respective countries.

Methodology

Two AMS were selected by AADCP II for this episode study - Myanmar and Philippines. AADCP II identified through available information that Myanmar and the Philippines were in the process of amending or improving their tourism and hospitality education and training policies and practices using tools supported by AADCP II. The study utilised two data collection techniques: (i) desktop review of relevant documents and (ii) phone/Skype interviews and email conversations as alternative data collection tools.

Semi-structured phone interviews and email discussions took place between April 8 – 20 2018. Interviews were held with ATPMC members, trainers, training providers and associations. While we acknowledge certain data limitations, where possible the evidence was validated and triangulated, including with reviews of related documents and regulations, and an assessment of the strength of the evidence in relation to the findings was made.

This report is structured by country: Myanmar and Philippines. The country case studies provide an account of the consumer protection context, the change story and a contribution statement. Sections 2 - 4 below present findings from each of the case studies.

² For detailed information on AADCP II projects, see link: <http://aadcp2.org/streams/#services>

2. MYANMAR

2.1. Context

Myanmar's tourism and hospitality education and training system is primed for significant development. It hopes to swiftly tackle the challenge of producing sufficient numbers of qualified human resources for tourism and hospitality to meet the sector's projected growth and realise the Government's vision of a high quality, service-oriented tourism sector. As yet, there are still many impediments, including shortage of qualified and experienced trainers, inadequate facilities and equipment, outdated curricula and teaching methodology, absence of a recognised set of standards, qualifications and quality assurance system, and lack of coordination. Of particular concern for the tourism industry is the lack of engagement it has with the education system and training providers. In addition, many of the current education and training programs are not accessible to the broader population, especially to rural, regional and disadvantaged groups that would greatly benefit from education and training and the concomitant employment opportunities.³

Key ministries that play a substantial role in tourism education and training and MRA-TP implementation in Myanmar include the Ministry of Hotels and Tourism (MoHT), Ministry of Labour, Immigration and Population, and Ministry of Education. MoHT is the designated agency with a mandate to guide the development of Myanmar tourism. Key functions of the MoHT among others are to upgrade quality, standards and technical skills of the tourism industry, create jobs and raise standards of living through tourism development.

2.2. Change Story

The Development of National Competency/Skills Standards

Myanmar, led by the MoHT,⁴ is currently developing its national occupational competency standards as mandated in the Employment and Skills Development Law (ESDL) 2013. The Law aims to improve quality and effectiveness of training systems and to promote mobility of skilled workers. It was noted that currently, there is no recognised set of industry standards or qualifications that could be referred to by education and training providers across both private and public sectors in Myanmar. Many public and private sector providers, as well as NGOs and development partners engaged in tourism education and training, used or adopted a combination of various international standards and resources in delivering tourism training and assessment activities.

It was noted by a staff of the Directorate of Hotels and Tourism of the MoHT and confirmed by the Myanmar Tourism Human Resource Development Association (MTHRDA) that MoHT used the AADCP I's ACCSTP⁵ and the associated training toolboxes developed by AADCP II⁶ as a key reference in the development of the national occupational competency standards (NOCS) for a number of priority occupations under tourism services and tour operation divisions⁷, through the technical support provided by International Labour Organization (ILO) and

³ The Myanmar Tourism Master Plan 2013 – 2018 and Myanmar Human Resource Development Strategy and Action Plan (2017-2020)

⁴ The sectoral committee of Hotel & Tourism is led by MoHT and supported by industry associations to assist the National Skills Standards Authority (NSSA) to establish competency standards in Myanmar. NSSA is responsible for establishing competency standards and conducting assessment for workforce development in Myanmar. It is led by the Ministry of Labour, Immigration and Population and comprises representatives of various Ministries concerned with skills developments including MoHT and Industry associations.

⁵ AADCP developed A set of minimum competency standards for tourism professionals. It is based upon the competencies required to perform a set of commonly agreed job titles in retail and wholesale travel companies, housekeeping, front office, and food & beverage service.

⁶ AADCP II helped develop training and assessment toolboxes based on ACCSTP. They serve as minimum standard reference for tourism training and education institutions across AMS in delivering competency-based training and assessment under the MRA-TP.

⁷ They are: Waiting Staff Level 1 – approved in 2014; Room Attendant Level 1 – approved in 2015; Basic Tour Guide Level 1 - approved in 2017 but not yet published; Regional Tour Guide Level 2 – approved in 2017 but not yet published; National Tour Guide Level 3 - approved in 2017 but not yet published; Bell Person Level 1; Public Area Attendant Level 1 – first consultation 23 March 2018; and Bakery Staff Level (1 & 2) & Pastry Staff Level (1&2) – first consultation on 28 March 2018.

Institut Européen de Coopération et de Développement (IECD). The development of these NOCS⁸, which was informed by the AADCP II/ASEAN ACCSTP, is a significant move for the country to promote systematic skills training and certification of skilled workers.

It was also noted that AADCP II materials were very useful to help the work of the MoHT as the sub-committee of Hotel and Tourism. An officer of MoHT said that the tourism sector is considered ahead of other sectors in regards to developing competency standards and without AADCP II support, implementation of necessary actions would have been delayed and even might not have moved forward.

There is moderate evidence that AADCP II through its support to the development of ACCSTP and the toolboxes played a significant role in helping MoHT develop the NOCS, which is a required mechanism to enable implementation of MRA-TP in Myanmar.

Upgrading tourism curriculum for universities

Another change in tourism education made by MoHT is the upgrade of the current curriculum for the Bachelor of Arts in Tourism and Hospitality Management which was developed by MoHT in 2012. During the interview, MoHT staff noted that the current curriculum had been developed with very limited knowledge about curriculum development. To improve the quality and relevance of the curriculum, MoHT noted that AADCP's CATC, along with other materials (e.g. European standards), was used as a key reference material when updating the curriculum.

CATC is focused on Competency Based Training (CBT), which is recognized worldwide as the most effective means of delivering vocational training. CATC provides teachers and trainees with the skills, knowledge and attitudes necessary to demonstrate competence. This concept is particularly applicable to tourism where 'attitude' is a vital element in customer contact and service situations⁹.

The new/updated curriculum will ensure learning program and qualifications are relevant and aligned with the ASEAN tourism standards as well as International standards. It was also noted that the MoHT received technical expertise from development partners in the revision process. The new curriculum will be taught in three universities in Myanmar starting mid of 2018.

The study found that there is moderate evidence to support some contribution of AADCP II's to MoHT's work in the development of curriculum in tourism and hospitality management.

Expanding pool of qualified tourism trainers and assessors

Currently, the pool of tourism lecturers and trainers in Myanmar is small, and they are mostly based in Yangon, the biggest city in Myanmar. Also, lecturers and trainers available often don't have current knowledge or skills of the discipline and are not skilled trainers¹⁰. The Government of Myanmar (GoM) in partnership with tourism and hospitality training providers under the MTHRDA (Myanmar Tourism HRD Association) has organised a series of nationwide train-the-trainer and assessor programme. The programme shares a similar objective with AADCP II ASEAN-wide training for master trainers and assessors program and aims to create a cadre of skilled master trainers and assessors, capable of building next generation of tourism lecturers and trainers competent in both technical areas and training skills.

The trainers of the program were Myanmar-based ASEAN Master Trainers and Master Assessors who participated in the AADCP II ToT. It was noted that they have passed on their skills and knowledge to 249 National Trainers and 49 National Assessors who were selected from tour agencies and training providers throughout Myanmar. Moreover, trainers/assessors that took part in both programs (ASEAN- and National- Master Trainers

⁸ NOCS is a key mechanism mandated in the ESD Law. It specifies standards of performance that people are expected to deliver in their work, and the knowledge and skills they need to possess.

⁹ ASEAN website

¹⁰ Myanmar Tourism HRD Strategy and Action Plan 2017 -2020

and Master Assessors training programs) acknowledged that both were useful and necessary in strengthening skills of trainers and they believed that they had contributed to lowering the shortage of skilled trainers.¹¹

The study found **there is moderate evidence to suggest that AADCP II's training for ASEAN Master Trainers and Master Assessors program and its associated toolboxes were useful and have helped Myanmar strengthen their trainers 'skills and develop pool of quality trainers.** Having a larger pool of skilled trainers and assessors in the country would enable training to take place in regional and rural areas where tourism activity is high but access to training is currently limited.

It was also noted during interviews that these trainers and assessors have participated in industry associations and have been actively involved in various hospitality and tourism education and vocational training programs, either organised by government agencies such as MoHT and Ministry of Education or by development partners such as the Government of Luxembourg and GlZ. For instance, as part of GoM's effort to develop the pool of skilled workers, MoHT in partnership with LuxDev engaged nine national trainers to deliver a series of hospitality short courses to trainers, hotel supervisors and managers of locally owned/ managed hotels. It was noted that the training materials included AADCP II's ASEAN training toolboxes, among others. As a result, 300 trainers, 93 hotel operation managers and 95 supervisors had been trained.

Example of utilisation of ASEAN toolboxes by tourism and hospitality training provider:

Mandalay Hotel and Vocational Training Institute/TRC Hotel and Vocation Training School, a leading private sector hospitality training provider, is led by an ASEAN Master Assessor, trained through AADCP II-supported ToT. Since 2013, the Institute has provided competency-based vocational skills training based on the ACCSTP, CATC and ASEAN toolboxes along with NSSA curriculum, changing its hospitality training course in accordance to ASEAN level I, II, III and IV.

Prior to that (2005 – 2012), the Institute referred to hospitality training curriculum from the UK due to the absence of a standardised curriculum at that time. It was noted that the use of ASEAN standards helped develop the tourism service industry and at the same time promoted the Institute as a reliable training provider for the tourism industry in Myanmar.

2.3. Overall findings

Overall findings from the Myanmar case study demonstrate that there is moderate evidence of AADCP II's significant contribution to MoHT's efforts in developing or amending the necessary mechanisms to enable MRA-TP implementation in Myanmar. ASEAN standards and its toolboxes provided more informed guidance to MoHT in developing national competency standards and tourism curriculum for universities. **AADCP II's training for ASEAN Master Trainers and Master Assessors significantly helped GoM in increasing the number of qualified trainers for the tourism industry.**

¹¹ A Review of Tourism Education and Training Providers, Myanmar HRD Strategy and Action Plan (2017-2020)

3. PHILIPPINES

3.1. Context

Philippines has well-developed tourism and hospitality education and training systems. The country has put in place a curriculum that aimed to make tourism education in the country more responsive to the needs of the tourism industry, and hence be able to address its manpower need since 2008¹².

The key agencies responsible for MRA-TP implementation in the Philippines are:

- Department of Tourism (DOT) takes the lead in developing, coordinating and implementing work program to enhance cooperation in tourism and provide mechanism to promote participations from private sector and NGOs.
- Technical Educational Skills and Development Authority (TESDA) is responsible for assessment of qualification and competencies of tourism professionals, and certificate issuance as specified in the ACCSTP.
- Tourism Industry Board Foundation Incorporated (TIBFI) is responsible for promoting awareness of MRA-TP and its elements/tools and share best practices in the sector.

3.2. Description of Outcomes

Memorandum Orders – CMO 62 s. 2017

The Commission on Higher Education (CHED) developed its CHED Memorandum Order (CMO) No. 62 s. 2017 on Policies, Standards and Guidelines for Bachelor of Science in Tourism Management (BSTM) and Bachelor of Science in Hospitality Management (BSHM) with inputs from TIBFI as a member of its technical committee, as well as DoT and the Philippines Business for Education. The CMO specifies expected learning outcomes for BSTM and BSHM graduates from all higher education institution (HEI) in the Philippines, and defines requirements for the delivery of the outcomes-based education programs.

During the interview, TIBFI noted CATC as one of the main materials they used in defining the minimum requirements. It was also noted that many of the requirements in the CMO were influenced by ASEAN standards. It can be surmised that **there is moderate evidence that AADCP output significantly contributed to TIBFI's work on the CHED Memorandum Order No.62 s. 2017.**

Training Regulations

Another change made by Philippines is the alignment of Training Regulation for technical vocational program to the ASEAN standards. Training Regulation is a TESDA-promulgated document that serves as a basis for the development of competency-based curriculum, instructional materials and competency assessment tools. This document presents specific qualifications, defining the competency standards for national qualifications and how such qualifications can be gained, assessed and recognised.

It was noted during the interview that, TIBFI and ASEAN Master Trainers and Master Assessors in the Philippines have been actively involved, mainly as experts in the review process of three Training Regulations for Housekeeping National Certificate (NC) II, Food & Beverage Services NC II, and Cookery NC II. The evidence from this study suggests that TESDA, TIBFI and ASEAN Master Trainers and Master Assessors used the ASEAN standards and toolboxes as key references in revising the TRs.

¹² Preparing Future Industry Leaders: A Framework for Philippines Tourism Education by Susan L. Solis, University of the Philippines

The study found **there is moderate evidence to suggest that AADCP II's ToT for ASEAN Master Trainer and Master Assessor, the associated toolboxes, and the ASEAN standards developed through AADCP were useful and significantly helped TESDA in revising the TR.**

National Master Trainers and Master Assessors training

To prepare for full implementation of MRA-TP, DOT initiated a National Master Trainers and Master Assessors training program in 2014 to create a cadre of skilled master trainers and master assessors in the country. Currently, DOT has organised five training programs in partnership with TESDA and TIBFI with particular focus on Food Production, Housekeeping and Food & Beverage Services.

The trainers of the program were ASEAN Master Trainers and Master Assessors who participated in the AADCP II regional ToT. It was noted that they have passed on their skills and knowledge to a total of 138 National Master Trainers and Master Assessors. The larger pool of Master Trainers and Master Assessors will enhance tourism human resource capacity and enable the Philippines to benefit more from the MRA-TP.

The study found **there is strong evidence to suggest that AADCP II's ToT for ASEAN Master Trainers and Master Assessors program and its associated training toolboxes have significantly helped DOT's effort to grow its pool of quality trainers and assessors.**

3.3. Overall findings

Overall findings from the Philippines case study suggested that there is moderate evidence that AADCP II has significantly helped support the efforts of DOT, TIBFI, TESDA and CHED for full implementation of the MRA-TP. The standard and ToT delivered by AADCP II have provided guidance to ATPMC members in Philippines in development of policies relating to higher education and revision of TR, to further develop the hospitality education and training in the Philippines.

4. Data sources and limitations of this study

The study is based on a document review of relevant AADCP II program documents and materials from ATPMC members, and other relevant reports and websites to complement data gathered from interviews. The study was only able to interview three of 8 key program informants identified by ASEC and ATPMC. AADCP II had approached all key informants for interview but received little response. Further, interviews were done over the phone/ Skype, making it difficult to contextualise, grasp the narrative information which affected the breadth of data and depth of analysis on the changes made in studied countries.

AADCP II

ASEAN - Australia Development Cooperation Program - Phase II

